

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

Name	Holy Trinity Church and Hall	
Address	1449 Dandenong Road MALVERN EAST	Significance Level A2
Place Type	ChurchChurch Hall	
Citation Date	2010	
Assessment by	Context P/L	



HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

Recommended **VHR - HI - PS** Yes
Heritage Protection

History and Historical Context

The early development of the site

The first church on the site was constructed in 1858. In a letter to the Editor of the *Church of England Record*, Rev. Liddiard (the Minister for the Parish of St. Kilda and its vicinity in the Port Phillip district) reported: "the opening of a church at Oakleigh township on Sunday last, the 25th instant, by the Lord Bishop of Melbourne, a place not long ago not scarcely known, but on which now stands an edifice such as might be truly said to grace any English village. It is a neat and permanent building of the Gothic style of architecture, but at a cost scarcely sufficient to lead you to expect anything so comely as presented to the eye". By the 1890s it was obvious that the church was no longer capable of meeting the needs of the congregation. A substantial extension of the church occurred in 1897. It included the addition of a chancel and extensions to the nave. By 1917, despite the improvements the church was again struggling to meet the needs of the community. During 1917, it was decided to pursue plans to build a new church. The old church (known as Liddiard hall) continued in use as a gymnasium and Sunday School. In 1937 a fire broke out in the old church. The roof was totally destroyed and the only object intact at the end was an old sewing machine in the vestry. The building was insured for £400 and the money was used to re-build the structure. It is extant on the site today.

Alfred Carleton

Plans were drawn up by the architect, A.E.H. Carleton and tenders were invited to commence work in 1919. Carleton set up practice with J.V.T. Ward in 1897 as Ward & Carleton. The partnership finished in 1913. From 1921 he was in partnership with his son C.R. Carleton as Carleton & Carleton. His death, in 1936, is recorded in the *Herald*. In 1912-13 Carleton designed a building at 285-7 La Trobe Street for H. Hearne and Company and a house in Queens Road, South Yarra. During the 1930's he was involved with the design and re-modelling of Commercial Banks in Orbost, Casterton, Sandringham and Bourke Street, Melbourne.

The new church

A tender by W. Simmons for 2,367 pounds was accepted to build the chancel, transepts, vestry and two bays of the nave. Grants of up to 500 pounds were received from the Archbishop in Council. An overdraft assisted in bridging the funding gap. The foundation stone of the new church was laid by the Archbishop of Melbourne on 12 April 1919. The completed church was dedicated on 2 November, 1919. In his speech at the dedication, the Archbishop of Melbourne, connected the construction of the church with broader changes in the suburb of Oakleigh:

Perhaps one of the best signs of pulsating vitality in a community such as Oakleigh may be gauged by the 'mercury' in the building trade. For a long time it has stayed 'zero'- cold, inert, forbidding- a 'good place to get out of'. But this is changing rapidly Today the hum all about bespeaks confidence, energy and progress. At the corner of Warrigal and Dandenong Roads, the members and adherents of Holy Trinity Church, wisely shepherded by the vicar, Rev. M.J.B. Bennett with clarity of vision, perceived the growing needs of the parish.

In furnishing the interior of the church, changes were also made- the pulpit was raised and enlarged and the choir seats were extended.

While substantial works were undertaken, the new church was not completed (two bays of the nave remained outstanding). The unfinished church was, for years disguised by the large cypress tree at the end of the church. The church was finally completed in 1960, Alec Henderson, acting as the architect. An amendment to the original plans saw the erection of a screen across the back of the nave to provide a suitable entrance to the main doorway. A feature of the north-west wall was: "a handsome window framed-up in pre-cast stone tracery to blend with the existing windows of the

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

church and glazed with leaded quarries of three shades of amber." The church vestry was also extended to the north, to provide a Vicar's vestry and an enlarged choir vestry and a chapel were added in the north transept." Changes were also made to Liddiard Hall- the leadlight window in the highlight above the porch in Liddiard Hall is believed to have been in the architect's South Yarra home. It was reportedly installed at the architect's (Henderson's) expense.

The new hall

In the 1890s a temporary building was purchased for the use of the Sunday school and moved to the site. In 1901, it was sold to make way for a new building. In 1901, the new building (the Parish Hall) was completed at a cost of 350 pounds. The new hall had capacity for 300 people. It seems to have been used by the Sunday School (at least until the construction of the new church in 1919) and was still in use in 2008.

New facilities

In addition to improvements to the Church, tenders were also called for the erection of new classrooms and a service block. A kitchen was located in the centre of the complex. The new facilities were opened in 1960. However, the plan to incorporate a cloister to link all the buildings on the Dandenong Road was initially put on hold. Work has since been undertaken and the buildings are now linked by a Sunday School hall.

Sources

Elder, Lynn. *Holy Trinity, a Pioneering Church on the Crossroads: A History of Oakleigh Anglican Church*, Oakleigh, Oakleigh Anglican Church, 2008.

Goldsworthy, Arthur. *The Beginnings of Trinity: A Research into the Early History of the Church of the Holy Trinity*, Oakleigh 1853-1866, Unpublished MS, Stonnington Local History Service, MH 8711.

The Herald, 19 February 1936.

Holy Trinity Church of England, Oakleigh, 70th Anniversary 1858-1928

National Trust of Australia (Victoria) File 2053/4.

Parish News, October 1960

Victorian Heritage Database. <http://vhd.heritage.vic.gov.au/places/heritage/64411>

Relevant Historical Australian Themes

Themes from Stonnington Thematic Environmental History:

10.2.1 Founding Churches

10.2.3 Churches as an illustration of key phases of suburban development

Description

Physical Description

The group of buildings at Holy Trinity comprise occupy a large semi-rural site on the corner of Dandenong and Warrigal Roads. The buildings are surrounded by open space, with scattered eucalypts and other plantings providing a setting to the group of three main buildings. The site has car parking and roads provided on unsealed surfaces, which adds to the

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

rural feel of the place. The earliest building is the polychrome brick church of 1858, now known as Liddiard Hall. It is designed in a gothic revival style with a central porch and pointed arch headed window above. This window is reputed to have been installed at a later date by the architect A.E.H Carleton. The brick building has a stone base and walls that are divided into bays with engaged buttresses. Cream brick is used as the quoining and highlighting to the buttresses and window reveals. Roofing is galvanized iron and there are extensions to both sides joining it to the timber hall and providing office space to the rear. A MMBW plan (date) shows the church with an extension to the rear in timber construction. The building joining the church to the hall has been constructed c.1960 and consists of a large space with glazed wall to the south and a flat roof. The timber hall has a similar form to the church, and is also designed in a gothic revival style. The detailing appropriate to the Gothic Revival style is translated into timber. The window architraves and pediments are unusual and surround the casement windows that are surmounted by a pointed arch headed fanlight window. The gable ends feature vertical timber strapping, and the semi-enclosed porch has an arched entry.

The church built in 1919 and designed by A.E.H. Carleton has an elongated cruciform plan and is built of red brick with rendered detailing as string courses, capping to buttresses and detailing around the arch headed windows. The plan of the church has an unusual plan whereby there is a large flat roofed area in the north east corner of the cruciform. This is designed in matching style and appears on an early MMBW plan indicating that it was either part of the original design or built a short time later. It has a rendered parapet with gothic arch motifs in relief pattern.

The form of the church consists of intersecting gable roof clad in terra cotta tile. There is distinctive stepped brickwork at the top of the walls that meets the buttresses and forms a panelled effect to each of the bays. There is a grey concrete brick porch of curved form and flat roof added to the front of the church.

Although alterations and additions have been undertaken to all buildings they are still clearly legible as three distinct structures as depicted on the MMBW plans. The integrity of the buildings has not been dramatically altered by the changes that have taken place on the site.

The remainder of the site has been used for the development of aged care units. A former manse shown on the MMBW plans no longer exists.

Comparative Analysis

Timber churches and halls were often built as temporary or auxiliary structures ready to be replaced when funds were available.

Approximately eight timber churches and halls are known to exist in Stonnington. This number includes some former churches, which have subsequently been adaptively reused as apartments, community centres etc. The hall at Holy Trinity is the most intact of the examples given below.

These include:

Former Methodist Church, 12 -14 Spring Road Malvern which also comprises three substantial buildings including a timber hall.

Chinese Christian Church of Victoria (former St Alban Anglican Church), cnr Orrong and Wynnstay Road, Prahran is has stylistic similarities and is of local significance with its adjacent church.

52-56 Serrell Street East Malvern (see above) had two excellent halls, one used as a kindergarten (now demolished) and the other has been significantly modified. It has been assessed as below the threshold of local significance.

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

Former Presbyterian Church, 10 Pine Grove, Malvern has been substantially altered by removal of the front porch and alteration of the front window and has been assessed as below the threshold of local significance

Spring Street Wesleyan Methodist Church, Spring Street, Prahran is highly modified with a new brick front and has been assessed as below the threshold of local significance

Russian Orthodox Church, Moore and Argo Streets, Prahran was relocated to the site and modified. It has been assessed as below the threshold of local significance.

Holy Trinity Church Complex in Malvern East is one of the most complete in Stonnington, comprising a particularly early church from 1858, a timber hall from 1901 and church from 1919.

The 1919 church by A.E.H Carleton is representative of his church architecture that uses traditional church form with some sophisticated use of detailing in render and some experimentation with church form.

Other works by Carleton include:

Chalmers Presbyterian Hawthorn is an axially planned church of red brick distinguished by the generous windows and the rendered parapet detailing.

St Paul's Anglican Canterbury (1914) is a red brick cruciform plan church with an unusual angled porch added in 1931. It is a more elaborate church than Holy Trinity but shares some of the same design features.
<http://www.stpaulscanterbury.org.au/history.htm>

St George's Antiochan Orthodox (f. Holy Trinity Anglican) Thornbury (Carleton and Carleton) is a free form church with a picturesque arrangement of porches and gables.

Statement of Significance

What is significant?

Holy Trinity Church complex corner of Dandenong and Warrigal Roads, Malvern East, comprising the church of 1858 (now called Liddiard Hall), the Hall of 1901, and the second church of 1919 designed by A.E.H. Carleton are of significance.

How is it significant?

The Holy Trinity Church complex is of local historic, architectural and social significance to the City of Stonnington.

Why is it significant?

Holy Trinity Church complex is notable as a largely intact group of church buildings in a semi rural setting. When built in 1858 the first church, was a particularly early building for the locality which was largely rural. Its construction date of 1858 makes it the earliest church still remaining in Stonnington. (Criterion A)

The buildings display a high degree of integrity in their setting on a large site that retains some of its semi-rural attributes through its eucalypts and unpaved roads and parking area.

HERITAGE CITATION REPORT

Although extensions and alterations have taken place to each of the buildings, these have largely been accommodated in a recessive manner whilst retaining the integrity of each building.

Holy Trinity Church Complex demonstrates the complete development of the parish from 1858 until c.1960 with the completion of the Sunday School hall between two buildings.

Liddiard Hall is notable for its English gothic revival design in dichrome brickwork. The extensions to the rear are not significant.

The timber hall of 1901 is of interest for its window detailing, porch and gable end decoration. The 1919 by architect A.E.H Carleton is a mainstream design representative of the inter-war Gothic Revival style, and a representative work by the architect. It is notable for the way in which the quite large extensions to the vestry are sympathetic with the original design intent. (Criteria D & E)

Recommendations 2010

External Paint Controls

Internal Alteration Controls

Tree Controls

Fences & Outbuildings

Prohibited Uses May Be Permitted

Incorporated Plan

Aboriginal Heritage Place

No
No
No
Yes Hall
No
None specified
No