

CITY OF YARRA RECEIVED	
11 DEC 2007	
FILE No.	
ATTN TO	
KEY WORD	254
DOC No.	
COPIES TO.	

File No. pl-he/03/0831

7 Dec 2007

Susan Hunt
Yarra City Council
P.O. Box 168
RICHMOND
VIC 3121

Dear Ms Hunt

ESPRIT DE CORPS COMPLEX, 18-62 TRENERRY CRESCENT ABBOTSFORD

Following its meeting of 28 September 2007, the Heritage Council determined that the above place was not of sufficient cultural heritage significance to warrant inclusion in the Victorian Heritage Register. The Heritage Council further resolved that the current inclusion in a Heritage Overlay as part of the Victoria Park Precinct in the Yarra Planning Scheme is appropriate. Enclosed is a copy of the Final Determination, including the revised Statement of Significance.

If you require any further information I can be contacted at heritage.council@dpcd.vic.gov.au or 9637 9297.

Yours sincerely



Brandi Bugh
Hearings Officer

Esprit de Corp

18-62 Trenerry Crescent, Abbotsford

Heritage Council Registrations Committee

Meeting – Friday, 28 September 2007

Members – Ms Meredith Gould, Ms Susan Brennan, Mr Ken Macleod

DECISION OF THE HERITAGE COUNCIL

The decision of the Committee in accordance with Section 42(1)(d)(ii) of the *Heritage Act* 1995 is to refuse to register the place known as Esprit de Corp and determine that it is more appropriate for the place to be protected under the *Planning & Environment Act* 1987.

The Committee considers that the place warrants the current inclusion under a Heritage Overlay in the Yarra Planning Scheme.

Meredith Gould

Susan Brennan

Ken Macleod

Decision Date – 7 December 2007

INTRODUCTION

The Site

- 1 Esprit de Corp is located at 18-62 Trenerry Crescent, Abbotsford.

Recommendation of the Executive Director

- 2 The Executive Director's recommendation was that the nominated place is not of cultural heritage significance to the State of Victoria and does not warrant inclusion in the Victorian Heritage Register. The Executive Director recommended the place for inclusion in the Heritage Overlay of the Yarra Planning Scheme. In addition, the Executive Director did not consider the 1984 additions to be of cultural heritage significance.

Preliminary Matters

- 3 The Esprit de Corp complex is currently covered by a Heritage Overlay under the Yarra Planning Scheme as part of the Victoria Park Precinct (HO337).
- 4 In their submission, Ms Susan Hunt and Mr Graeme Butler made a request to present their position. However, while any party can make a submission, only the nominator, owner, relevant local planning authority or the National Trust of Australia (Victoria) can request a hearing. In the absence of such request, a hearing did not occur.

Nomination

- 5 A nomination was received by Heritage Victoria on 27 November 2006 from Mr Will Harkness. Mr Harkness stated that the place was of historical significance, representing two eras of the area's industrial history; and of architectural significance for the 1984 additions designed by Mr Daryl Jackson. Mr Harkness commented that the additions to the complex were an excellent example of conservation and reuse of an industrial site at that time.

SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

The Executive Director of Heritage Victoria

- 6 The Executive Director of Heritage Victoria recommended that the place is not of State significance and does not warrant inclusion in the Heritage Register. The Executive Director recommended that the current level of protection, as part of the Victoria Park Precinct in the Heritage Overlay of the Yarra Planning Scheme, was an appropriate level of protection. Additionally, the Executive Director considered that the 1984 additions were not of cultural heritage significance.
 - 7 According to the Executive Director, the 1984 date for the Daryl Jackson designed additions was provided to Heritage Victoria by the nominator and confirmed by the builder.
-

Owner

- 8 SJB Planning provided a submission on behalf of the owner. According to the submission, the owner is of the view that the Executive Director's recommendation, including the statement of significance and reason, is a reasonable and accurate assessment.
- 9 SJB Planning informed the Committee that the Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal had recently ordered the issue of a planning permit for the proposed redevelopment of the property.
- 10 Upon the request of the Heritage Council, SJB Planning on behalf of the owner provided a copy of a planning permit issued (7 September 2007) by the City of Yarra.

Other Submitters

- 11 Ms Hunt and Mr Butler provided a submission requesting a review of the Executive Director's recommendation, statement of significance and reasons. The submission requested that the Committee recognise the Daryl Jackson designed additions to be of local historical and architectural significance.
- 12 Ms Hunt and Mr Butler submitted that the complex demonstrates the resurgence of the clothing and textile industry in the area, and that the Executive Director's recommendation did not recognise the architectural merit of the complex for the Daryl Jackson additions and the approach to conservation of an industrial site at that time.

REASONS

- 13 The Committee determined that the place does not have sufficient cultural heritage significance to warrant listing in the Heritage Register.
 - 14 The Committee considers that the place warrants the current inclusion under a Heritage Overlay in the Yarra Planning Scheme
 - 15 The Committee was not satisfied on the basis of the material presented that good quality conservation work from the 1980s is worthy of protection under either the *Heritage Act* 1995 or through a heritage overlay in the local planning scheme; or that the particular works undertaken to the design by Daryl Jackson have greater significance than similar projects incorporating heritage elements.
 - 16 The c1984 structures consist of an office building on the northern side of the site, a glazed link between it and the 1911 building, a second glazed link between the 1911 and 1920s buildings and a glazed warehouse building to the rear of the site. The c1984 development also includes the adaptation of the two earlier buildings resulting in the loss of some integrity.
 - 17 The 1984 works were designed with an industrial theme, in keeping with the site's history. The office block emulates an early twentieth century industrial structure and the glazed warehouse was built in the manner of a saw tooth roofed industrial building. The glazed linking elements also adopt an industrial theme, referencing
-

elements from older industrial structures such as the gable ends and roof ventilators.

- 18 The 1984 additions are of interest in demonstrating a late twentieth century architectural response to an early twentieth century industrial complex. In the absence of historical, scientific or social significance, relatively new works such as these should be architecturally exceptional to be considered as having cultural heritage significance. The Daryl Jackson design at this site is not considered to be architecturally significant at a State or local level.
- 19 Whilst other dates for the works have been suggested, the Committee did not place any weight on the precise date for the c1984 works. The variation of one or two years does not affect the Committee's decision in relation to the significance of the design by Daryl Jackson.
- 20 The 1911 and the 1920s buildings are not architecturally outstanding but are typical of early twentieth century industrial buildings common in the Abbotsford and Collingwood area. Their contribution to the streetscapes and the riverscape, and their overall form, illustrate the role of the place in the local industrial economy.

CONCLUSION

- 21 The Committee is appreciative of the written submissions provided by the Executive Director, SJB Planning and Ms Hunt and Mr Butler.
 - 22 The Committee determined that the place has not met the Heritage Council's criteria in Section 8(2) of the *Heritage Act* 1995, and therefore does not have sufficient cultural heritage significance to be included in the Heritage Register.
 - 23 The Committee determined that the current inclusion in a Heritage Overlay as part of the Victoria Park Precinct in the Yarra Planning Scheme, is appropriate. The Committee considers the complex to be of local historical significance for its association with the clothing and textile industry in the local area in the early twentieth century.
 - 24 The Committee has revised the Statement of Significance (see Attachment 1).
-

ATTACHMENT 1

Statement of Significance

The Esprit de Corp complex at 18-62 Trenerry Crescent, Abbotsford is a collection of six structures that includes an industrial structure built for W. Saunders & Son, malt extract and cod liver oil manufacturer, built in 1911; a later industrial building, believed to have been built during the 1920s for an engineering works; and four later structures, designed by the architect Daryl Jackson and complete by 1984. The later works are part of the adaptive reuse of the place for the Esprit de Corps clothing company. The two early twentieth century structures were adapted during the 1984 works and have been altered with the loss of some integrity.

The 1911 and the 1920s buildings are not architecturally outstanding but are significant at the local level as typical of early twentieth century industrial buildings common in the Abbotsford and Collingwood areas. Their contribution to the streetscapes and the riverscape, and their overall form, illustrate the role of the place in the local industrial economy. The 1984 works are of some architectural interest.

The 1911 and 1920s buildings are of historical significance at the local level for the demonstration of industrial heritage in the Abbotsford and Collingwood area, in particular the resurgence of industrial activity in the area in the early part of the twentieth century following the 1890s depression.
