Name House Reference No

Address 6 Summerlea Grove, Hawthorn Survey Date 28 April 2006

Building Type Residence Grading C*

Date 1927 Previous C*3



Extent of Overlay To title boundaries.

Grading

Intactness Ü Good Fair Poor

Heritage Status HV AHC NT Rec BPS Heritage Overlay

History

In December 1923, allotments in the *Summerlee* estate subdivision were offered for sale, following the death of the property's owner Sir George Turner ¹ The original Turner residence is thought to be extant today, now known as *Summerlea Lodge*, a block of flats at the northeast corner of Glenroy Road. Rate records for the 1925-26 rate cycle recorded that lots 8-10 (today 2-6 Summerlea Grove) were occupied by two unfinished houses – the one at No 2 Summerlea Grove being described as eight rooms brick and that at No 6 as eleven rooms brick. These flanked a seven room brick house at No 4 Summerlea Grove, occupied by accountant Harold Darby. The owners of the unfinished houses were George Towers and John Marriage of Windsor. ²

It has not been possible to discern whether No 6 Summerlea Grove, the largest of the three properties, was actually designed and constructed as a single residence. As within a few years (by 1931-32), the property was described as two flats owned by Towers and Marriage and occupied by Dr Charles Adey (6 room flat) and Evan Wade (5 room flat).³ The building continued to be utilized as flats with John Marriage himself listed as an occupant in the late 1940s. Managed by estate agents J Purvis & Son, Hawthorn for many years, the property was sold in 1976, and after a series of alterations, appears to have been converted to a single dwelling.⁴

(G Butler & Associates, *Hawthorn Keynote Places (draft)*, 2000; Meredith Gould Conservation Architects, *Hawthorn Heritage Study*, 1992; additional research by Lovell Chen, 2006)

Description & Integrity

No 6 Summerlea Grove, Hawthorn, is a two-storied asymmetrically planned brick residence. The front façade adopts a stepped form, with the central porch and balcony and projecting eastern wing both sitting forward of the western end of the façade.

The main roof form is hipped and clad in Marseilles pattern terracotta tiles, as are the two secondary hipped forms projecting forward. The chimneys are brick, clad in roughcast stucco, with clinker-brick

necks and projecting tops corbelled on single header bricks. The eaves run flush under the roof, upward at an angle and are carried on exposed rafters.

The front elevation is framed by five masonry piers, the two framing the central porch being in stucco-covered brick, the remaining three, one at the north-west corner, the other two framing the projecting wing on the east front, being left as exposed face clinker brick. The corner piers stop short of the main roof and are carried visually, through a set of applied timber straps. The north-west bay is in fact two coupled canted bay windows divided only by the corner pier, a common Bungalow era motif.

Generally, most of the original windows are double-hung sashes with parallel and diamond-pattern leadlighting. In the case of the western bay, the first floor windows are in a bracketed box frame, with exposed clinker brick aprons immediately below, while on the ground floor is a projecting canted bay comprising three double-hung sashes with a curved and shingled apron.

The central balcony sits over the porch on a timber floor layer expressed externally with deep joists in a rather Japanese manner; above these the original shingling remains. The balcony itself appears to have been infilled with the addition of a series of horizontal windows. Behind the porch, the front doors are plainly framed in timber and may be an alteration.

Both ground and first floor levels of the eastern wing have large curved bay windows, comprising four double-hung sashes with a curved and shingled apron. The base is also in clinker brick.

To the extent it is visible from the street, the western side elevation of the house appears to be intact, including original windows. On the eastern side, a single-storey garage has been constructed. As viewed from the street this is presented as a solid brick garage wall with three slots above it, connected visually to the house by a scroll console. The garage doors immediately below feature vertical planking, slit windows and an embedded arch motif. This garage structure appears to be a later addition, possibly dating from c. 1976-8.⁵

Overall, the building appears to be broadly intact, other than for the infilling of the central balcony, possibly the modification of the entry doors within the porch, and the addition of the garage on the eastern side.

The property fence appears to be original, at least to the extent of the rendered brick piers, between which are located intermediate spans in slatted timber. The garden retains some mature tree specimens. A swimming pool was installed in 1987.

Historical Context

As noted above, in December 1923, allotments in the *Summerlee* estate subdivision were offered for sale, following the death of the property's owner Sir George Turner ⁷

Comparative Analysis

No 6 Summerlea Grove, Hawthorn, is a large house, asymmetrical to either side of a unifying central wing supported on columns or heavy piers. It resembles other houses of this period which are dominated by a central porch and balcony or chamber above that, a genre that had origins in atticstorey Federation houses, particularly in the Kew area.

High profile examples preceding this one would include Harold Desbrowe- Annear's MacKinnon, Kaye and Merfield houses, all in Toorak, of 1923-6. In Boroondara, Gawler and Drummond's 158 Mont Albert Road, 1920, (B-graded) was another of this type, albeit with the porch and balcony facing east to one side, as with *Netherby* at Studley Avenue Kew, 1915-17, by Osborn McCutcheon for Bates, Peebles and Smart. These examples used the central porch as a unifying device for otherwise asymmetrical fronts. *Netherby* used a conspicuously beamed platform to mark the balcony floor, as did No 6 Summerlea Grove. While perhaps not as distinctive or well-executed as some of these earlier examples, 6 Summerlea Grove is a fine and relatively externally intact example of the form.

The other conspicuous inheritance in the design of this building is the roughcast pier and shingled apron mode of the 'Manhattan Bungalow' typology of flats in the South Yarra and St Kilda areas, popular from the late teens into the early 1920s and heavily publicised in both the *Real Property Annual* and the *Australian Home Builder*. These were found in Toorak Road, the city end of

Dandenong Road and St Kilda Road. These blocks were designed to resemble houses or attached houses rather than flats, which still carried a social stigma in the 1920s. The central porch and balcony, in particular, could be used to give flats a 'detached house' appearance. This is seen in the *Sheringham* Flats, 206-8 Cotham Road Kew, of 1924-5 (B-graded), or *Whitehall* in Burwood Road Hawthorn, c. 1928 (ungraded).

However, No 6 Summerlea Grove appears to have built originally as a single residence, and is unusually close to the apartment house typology; it may be that a conversion to flats was contemplated as a future option.¹⁰

Assessment Against Criteria

Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria

CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.

No 6 Summerlea Grove, Hawthorn, is a handsome and relatively intact example of a large interwar residence of the 1920s, with prominent hipped roof and an asymmetrical front dominated by a central balcony and porch and also featuring a circular side bay. It features materials and detailing typical of the period, including face brickwork, roughcast stucco, Marseilles pattern terracotta tiles, and shingling. The property retains its original front fence. It is of interest for its link to a related form seen in the 1920s, the flat block designed to appear as a single residence, possibly contemplating a later conversion to flats.

Statement of Significance

No 6 Summerlea Grove, Hawthorn, is of local historical and architectural significance as a handsome and relatively intact example of a large interwar residence of the 1920s, with a prominent hipped roof and an asymmetrical front dominated by a central balcony and porch and also featuring a circular side bay. It features materials and detailing typical of the period, including face brickwork, roughcast stucco, Marseilles pattern terracotta tiles, and shingling. The property retains its original front fence. It is of interest for its link to a related form seen in the 1920s, the flat block designed to appear as a single residence, possibly contemplating a later conversion to flats. While some alterations have occurred, these are of a relatively minor nature and do not compromise the street presentation of the building.

Grading Review

Unchanged.

Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

Identified By

Meredith Gould Conservation Architects, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992.

References

General: (G Butler & Associates, *Hawthorn Keynote Places (draft)*, 2000; Meredith Gould Conservation Architects, *Hawthorn Heritage Study*, 1992.)

Specific:

- ¹ Summerlee estate, subdivision plan, 15 December 1923, Batten & Percy collection, State Library of Victoria.
- ² City of Hawthorn Rate Books, 1925-26, cited in G Butler & Associates, Hawthorn Keynote places (draft), 2000.
- ³ City of Hawthorn Rate Books, 1931-32, #3746-7, cited in G Butler & Associates, *Hawthorn Keynote Places* (draft), 2000
- ⁴ Pattern of occupation derived from listings in the *Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria*, various years between 1930 and 1974; other details drawn from the draft citation prepared by G Butler & Associates, *Hawthorn Keynote Places* (draft), 2000.
- ⁵ City of Hawthorn Building Card Index, # 12867, dated 26 July 1976, inspected 20 January 1978 (alterations, garage and verandah). The MMBW Plan of Drainage, # 1480, various dates, 1927-1942, appears to show a garage set back from the street, at the south-west corner of the house.

⁶ City of Hawthorn Building Card Index, # 12867, dated 26 July 1976, inspected 20 January 1978 (alterations, garage and verandah); # 4863 (3541), dated 20 July 1987 (pool).

⁷ Summerlee estate, subdivision plan, 15 December 1923, Batten & Percy collection, State Library of Victoria.

⁸ Harriet Edquist notes that these are actually a porch-chamber genre, rather than a balconied porch. See her *Harold Desbrowe-Annear: a Life in Architecture*, Melbourne, Miegunyah, 2004, pp. 150-5.

⁹ These houses are imaged in Julie Willis, Part 3 of Philip Goad (ed., contrib.), *Bates Smart*, Melbourne, Thames and Hudson, 2004, pp. 114-19.

¹⁰ This is of interest in the context of the original *Summerlea's* conversion to flats at the time this house was being built, see discussion in Butler's *Hawthorn Keynote Places*, pp. 194-5.