

Butcher's Shop & Residence, former

Adopted : 18 August 2014

Prepared by: Context Pty Ltd

Address: 287 - 289 Auburn Road, Hawthorn

Name: Butcher's Shop and Residence, former	Survey Date: 24 Aug. 2012
Place Type: Commercial	Architect:
Grading: Individually significant	Builder:
Extent of Overlay: To title boundaries	Construction Date: 1909-10



Historical Context

In the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, the expanding transport network (trains and trams) had a major impact on commercial development. In the 1880s the extension of the railway caused a boom of retail expansion in the existing commercial strips on Glenferrie Road, Auburn Road and Burke Road, as well as the establishment of new retail centre around Canterbury and Surrey Hill stations (Built Heritage 2012:98).

The first horse-drawn tram terminus was established in January 1890 at the corner of Riversdale and Auburn roads. As a result, the intersection became the centre of a new commercial precinct (City of Boroondara Local History Wiki).

By 1890 the Auburn and Burwood roads intersection was a well-established retail centre (Gould 1993:54). By 1900, Kew Junction, Camberwell Junction and the hub at the intersection of Glenferrie and Burwood roads were the established pre-eminent retail areas, while Auburn Road in Hawthorn East followed close behind (Built Heritage 2012:100).

History

In 1908, William Carr, butcher (of Auburn Road) became the owner of land that included 287-289 Auburn Road (LV: V3259/F684).

Prior to this date (from at least 1900, as confirmed in the street directories) W A Carr had run a butcher's shop a few doors down from the current building, on Auburn Road just north of Broomfield Road (then number 223). By 1910, William A Carr, butcher was operating further north at what is now 287-289 Auburn Road (then numbers 209-211), while this site had been noted as vacant land a year earlier (S&Mc directories), giving a built date of 1909-10. The site of Carr's previous shop was shown as vacant land in 1910, suggesting it had been demolished.

The architect of the building at what is now 287-289 Auburn Road has not been identified. While stylistically it has much in common with the work of architect Robert Haddon, no tender notice for the building could be located, nor is the designer recorded in the City of Boroondara buildings files.

The Hawthorn City Council approved the registration of 'W A Carr, butcher, 211 Auburn Road' at their 13 July 1910 meeting (*Box Hill Reporter*, 22 July 1910: 7). By 1918 the street numbering had changed, and 'W A Carr, Wholesale and Retail Butcher' was advertising from 287-289 Auburn Road (*Hawthorn, Kew and Camberwell Citizen*, 19 April 1918: 3). 'W A Carr Butcher' remains inscribed on the parapet of the building.

Carr later subdivided his property and in July 1936, the shops and residence at 287-289 were sold to Charles Lloyd (LV: V3259/684).

The shop at number 287 had 'alterations' carried out in 1987, for owner Rushbank Pty Ltd. The shop front of number 289 was rebuilt in 1973 by G&G Shop Fitters, for owner A Rouge. In 1987, a brick 'factory' was built at number 289 for owner J C Morley (Council building files); this appears to be at the rear of the site.

Description & Integrity

The former W.A. Carr's Butcher Shop is a two-storey brick building with two shops to the ground floor and an upstairs residence, with its entrance between the shops. The walls are of red brick with render dressings in the Federation Freestyle style (also called the Edwardian Baroque). The building is distinguished by its unusual design, evocative of the work of architect Robert Haddon, particularly details such as 'pepper-pot' pinnacles to the parapet and the wide tiled arch.

The ground floor is divided into three sections of differing size. At number 287 is a narrow shopfront with a central recessed entry. It retains its original metal-framed shopfront with frosted glass highlights, a glazed timber door, and tiled stallboard (overpainted). Next to it is a narrow recessed entry to the upstairs residence (number 289A), which retains its original doorway (three-panelled door with an arched light, small sidelight and two highlights with simple leadlights in them, and a bluestone lintel). The south half of the facade comprises a larger shopfront (likely the location of Carr's butcher shop).

All parts of the ground floor share a timber-framed skillion verandah with simple vertical slats at either end. It is suspended on cables, which may have been a later alteration to an originally posted verandah.

The upper floor is symmetrical in form, divided into three bays by plain brick pilasters. The central bay is the most striking, and is almost wholly taken up by a large round-

headed arch with a very fine bead around the edge executed in moulded red brick. At the centre of the arch is a simple render keystone, and the sides of the arch rest on dwarf piers with Art Nouveau capitals. Between the piers is a balustrade of hit-and-miss brick. The spandrels of the arch are filled with grass-green tiles. Set behind the arch is a balcony for the residence.

The two side bays each have a canted oriel window resting on two curved timber brackets and set beneath a tiled hood resting on larger curved brackets infilled with slats (like the verandah ends). The windows are casements with segmentally arched tops below leadlight highlights (similar to those above the entry door).

Apart from the arch at the centre of the first floor, the other most striking feature of the facade is the parapet, which is divided into three bays by octagonal pinnacles with Baroque-inspired 'pepper-pot' tops. They taper off to a point where they meet the brick pilasters, at the top of the first floor facade. The two side bays of the parapet are of plain brick with moulded cement dressings above and below. The central bay of the parapet, however, is finished in smooth render (with raised lettering: W.A. CARR. BUTCHER.). It is higher than the two sides, as are the flanking pinnacles, and follows an undulating arch, typical of the Federation Freestyle.

The roof is not visible behind the front or side parapets, but there is a corbelled brick chimney on the north and south sides, near the front.

All of the rendered details of the facade (stringcourses, cornice, engaged 'columns', arched parapet) are free from modern paint. There are hints of a yellowish colour on sheltered parts of the render, suggesting it may have been limewashed or colourwashed originally. Optimally, this should be investigated before any repainting/recoating so that the original colour and finish type can be reinstated. There is a faded painted sign on the upper part of the north wall (number 287).

At the rear of number 289 is a single storey wing which is attached to a two-storey, gabled stables at the back of the property, all in the same red facebrick as the main building.

External alterations to the building noted are as follows: The tiled stallboard to number 287 has been overpainted, as has the facebrick around the shopfront and entrance to number 289A. The entire shopfront at number 289 has been replaced with an unsympathetic modern one. All windows (all with segmentally arched brick lintels and bluestone sills) to the south side elevation of number 289 and the stables at the rear have been filled in with brick, as have the upper-level openings to the stables. A large opening for a modern roller door was also created to the east elevation of the stables. This was likely part of the works to create a factory in the rear yard in 1987.

Comparative Analysis

Buildings comparable to W.A. Carr's Butcher Shop, in style, creativity and intactness are small in number in the City of Boroondara. The handful of suitable examples found are:

- 108-112 Maling Road, Canterbury (Individually Significant to HO145) - Built 1914. Three identical two-storey shops in a row with residences above (each with a recessed balcony). Render with brick accents (mainly overpainted). Each shop has an identical undulating-curved parapet between projecting piers with pepper-pot caps. Hit-and-miss brick band to balconies and simple leadlight windows on either side. Shops retain their metal and tiled shopfronts and timber posted verandah.

- Former State Savings Bank, 851 Burke Road, Camberwell (Individually Significant to HO505) - Built 1907. A large, two-storey red brick and render building with octagonal engaged piers dividing the four bays. The ground floor openings are arched and above them are very ornate floral reliefs. The two wide bays of the first floor have canted oriel windows with ornate leadlights above the casement windows. The simple red brick parapet is divided by the tops of the octagonal piers of varying sizes. A building of very high quality and formal detail.
- Hawthorn Fire Station, 66-68 Williams Street (VHR H1327) - Built 1910 to a design by Oakden and Ballentyne. A fine example of a Federation Freestyle building in red brick with minimal render dressings and Art Nouveau-inspired wrought iron detail. Quite different in form and detail to Carr's Butcher Shop, apart from the large round-headed arches to the ground-floor window and garage entries, and the used of miniature curved parapets at the corner of the roof (suggesting a tower).

In comparison to the Maling Road shops, Carr's Butcher Shop is of comparable intactness (while it only retains one of two original shopfronts, its brick and render have not been overpainted), and is a more striking architectural composition. In comparison to the former Bank, its detailing is more domestic and quality of the renderwork not as exquisite, but its parapet is of greater interest. (It is far more intact, as well, as all that remains of the Bank is its facade.)

Further afield, in the City of Yarra, two more comparable buildings were noted, neither of whose architect has been identified, but similarities to Robert Haddon's work was noted:

- 162-164 Bridge Road, Richmond (Individually Significant to HO310), c1900-15. Similar materials palette (red brick and unpainted render), undulating curve to parapet and pepper-pot pinnacles.
- 486-488 Bridge Road, Richmond, (Individually Significant to HO310), 1917 (488) & 1924 (486 - dates on parapet). Similar materials palette (red brick and unpainted render), use of round arch with green tiled spandrels (though here with a Saracenic flavour), unusual pinnacles to parapet (here with ball at top).

Assessment Against Criteria

Criteria referred to in *Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay*, Department of Planning and Community Development, September 2012, modified for the local context.

CRITERION A: Importance to the course, or pattern, of the City of Boroondara's cultural or natural history (historical significance).

The complex of butcher's shop and stables demonstrates the importance of horse-drawn transport to businesses in the 19th and early 20th century.

CRITERION B: Possession of uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of the City of Boroondara's cultural or natural history (rarity).

A rare example in Boroondara of the Federation Freestyle.

CRITERION C: Potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the City of Boroondara's cultural or natural history (research potential).

Not applicable.

CRITERION D: Importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of cultural or natural places or environments (representativeness).

Not applicable.

CRITERION E: Importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics (aesthetic significance).

The former Carr's Butcher Shop is a distinguished example of the Federation Freestyle of the ilk practiced by architect Robert Haddon among others. The designer of this building has not been identified. It demonstrates the use of red facebrick paired with render dressings, the strong round arch to the balcony, Art Nouveau inspired detail such as the floral capitals, and the distinctive parapet with a curved central bay and articulated with octagonal pinnacles with pepper-pot tops.

CRITERION F: Importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period (technical significance).

Not applicable.

CRITERION G: Strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. This includes the significance of a place to Indigenous peoples as part of their continuing and developing cultural traditions (social significance).

Not applicable.

CRITERION H: Special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the City of Boroondara's history (associative significance).

Not applicable.

Statement of Significance

What is Significant?

The former W.A. Carr's Butcher Shop and Residence at 287-289 Auburn Road, Hawthorn, built in 1909-1910 for local butcher William A Carr and owned and occupied by him until 1936. It is a two-storey brick building with render dressings which incorporates two shopfronts and a residential entrance at the ground floor, residence at the upper level. The upper level is articulated with two timber oriel windows and a central balcony behind a large arch.

The building is significant to the extent of the original fabric, later alterations and additions are not significant. The two-storey stables at the rear of number 289 is contributory.

How is it significant?

The former Carr's Butcher Shop is of local architectural and historic significance to the City of Boroondara.

Why is it significant?

The former Carr's Butcher Shop is well-preserved and distinguished example of the Federation Freestyle of the ilk practiced by architect Robert Haddon. It demonstrates the use of red facebrick paired with render dressings, the strong round arch to the balcony, Art Nouveau inspired detail such as the floral capitals, and the distinctive parapet with a curved central bay and articulated with octagonal pinnacles with pepper-pot tops. It is also notable for the survival of the render in an unpainted condition. (Criterion E)

The complex of butcher's shop and stables demonstrates the importance of horse-drawn transport to businesses in the 19th and early 20th century, when most businesses had to maintain their own cart and horses for everyday use. (Criterion A)

Grading and Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme as an Individually Significant place.

Recommendations for the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay (Clause 43.01) in the Boroondara Planning Scheme:

External Paint Colours <i>Is a permit required to paint an already painted surface?</i>	No
Internal Alteration Controls <i>Is a permit required for internal alterations?</i>	No
Tree Controls <i>Is a permit required to remove a tree?</i>	No
Victorian Heritage Register <i>Is the place included on the Victorian Heritage Register?</i>	No
Incorporated Plan <i>Does an Incorporated Plan apply to the site?</i>	No
Outbuildings and fences exemptions <i>Are there outbuildings and fences which are not exempt from notice and review?</i>	No
Prohibited uses may be permitted <i>Can a permit be granted to use the place for a use which would otherwise be prohibited?</i>	No
Aboriginal Heritage Place	No

<i>Is the place an Aboriginal heritage place which is subject to the requirements of the Aboriginal Heritage Act 2006?</i>	
--	--

Identified By

M Gould, Hawthorn Heritage Study, 1992.

References

Boroondara City Council, building files, 287 & 289 Auburn Road.

Built Heritage (2012), 'City of Boroondara Thematic Environmental History', prepared for the City of Boroondara.

Gould, Meredith (1993), 'Hawthorn Heritage Study', Vol 1A, prepared for Hawthorn City Council.

Land Victoria (LV), Certificates of Title, as cited above.

Sands & McDougall (S&Mc) directories, dates as cited above.

The Box Hill Reporter.

The Hawthorn, Kew and Camberwell Citizen.