El Paso Reference No Name **Address** 294 Cotham Road, Kew 13 December 2005 **Survey Date Building Type** Residence Grading Date 1930 **Previous** В Grading



# **Extent of Overlay**

✓ Good Intactness Fair Poor Heritage Status AHC Rec. **BPS** Heritage Overlay

# **History**

El Paso, 294 Cotham Road was built in 1930 for Mrs Lizzie Hutton. 1 Previously the allotment had formed part of the grounds of Charleville, a large Victorian house, subsequently named Ross House, which is still extant to the west of the subject property.<sup>2</sup> Municipal rate records for 1930-31 described the property as a seven-roomed brick residence on a land holding with a frontage of 100 feet and a depth of 160 feet.<sup>3</sup> Mrs Hutton did not reside at the address for long – by 1934, the property had changed hands and the new owners, William and Edith Collie occupied the property until the early 1960s. 4 By the middle of the 1960s the property was owned by H F Tompkins, who retained it until at least 1974.5

(G Butler & Associates, Kew B-graded buildings study (draft), 2001, additional research by Lovell Chen, 2005)

## **Description & Integrity**

El Paso, named after a city and former mission in southern Texas, is a substantial brick house with Mediterranean and in particular Spanish Mission details, placed transverse on a large site and marked so with a long hipped roof in terracotta tiles in a Marseilles pattern. The walls are brick and covered in textured stucco. The windows are a series of sashes generally separated by mullions with spiral patterned columns, with some of the windows directly arched or with blind arches above, forming Serlian window patterns.

The front, facing Cotham Road, has a projecting parapet wall defined with a smooth stuccoed border, composed around a central semicircular moulding. This projecting part, a breakfront, effectively, contains a porch and some room space behind it, the porch being expressed with a pair of open fullheight arches, counterbalanced by two glazed arches at the other end.

The house appears to be intact, with few works recorded in the Council records consulted. A swimming pool was added in 1981, decking – presumably to the rear – was added in 2004, and the house was restumped.<sup>6</sup>

The garden appears largely contemporary with the house, and is marked by several large trees offsetting the house composition carefully, and a placement of lower, darker shrubs to heighten a sense of light increasing at the surfaces of the original house. The fence, a low brick wall strengthened with piers, is clad in textured stucco and appears to be original.

#### **Historical Context**

The grounds to the east of the mansion, *Charleville* (*Ross House*), were subdivided to provide the allotment for *El Paso*. Historically, development at the turn of the twentieth century consisted of large mansions on substantial allotments, as well as some smaller brick villas.<sup>7</sup> The area in the vicinity of the subject property, was further developed for residential use during the early decades of the twentieth century, presumably prompted by its proximity to Kew Junction and the tram service.

#### **Comparative Analysis**

El Paso is an impressive and externally intact single-storey variant of the Spanish Mission and Mediterranean modes as practiced in 1930. Its Cotham Road front appears virtually intact. The near symmetrical composition resembles a larger version of symmetrical and carriage-sweep houses in the Mediterranean mode elsewhere in Boroondara, as with 63 Cookson Street Camberwell, built in the same period. It also compares with several hipped roofed 'Mission' houses in the East Malvern – Murrumbeena- Waverley Road area, in its composition, weight and use of Serlian window detailing. Like them, it also seems as concerned to evoke a simple hipped-roof oblong form, rather like Hardy Wilson's part Mediterranean, part Regency Colonial Purulia in Wahroonga NSW, published widely in Art in Australia and The Home.<sup>8</sup> Its scale, horizontality and fairly flat site also parallel 1930s houses in the Beverley Hills district of Los Angeles, and El Paso certainly speaks of Hollywood as a mediation for Spanish mission houses in Melbourne.<sup>9</sup> Compositionally, the house appears comparatively staid alongside the more lively inventions of Howard Lawson's Beverley Hills, South Yarra, 1935-6.

#### **Assessment Against Criteria**

Amended Heritage Victoria Criteria

CRITERION D: The importance of a place or object in exhibiting the principal characteristics or the representative nature of a place or object as a part of a class or type of places or objects.

*El Paso* is an impressive (albeit compositionally somewhat staid) and externally intact example of the Spanish Colonial Mission applied to a conventional hipped roof rectangular pavilion house form.

## Statement of Significance

*El Paso*, at 294 Cotham Road, Kew, is of local historical and architectural significance as a fine, impressive, and externally intact example of the Spanish Colonial Mission applied to a conventional hipped roof rectangular pavilion house form. While compositionally somewhat staid when compared with the better metropolitan examples of the style, *El Paso* is distinguished by its intactness (including original fence) and is complemented by its garden setting.

# **Grading Review**

Unchanged.

## Recommendations

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Boroondara Planning Scheme.

## **Identified By**

Pru Sanderson Design Pty Ltd, Kew Urban Conservation Study, 1988

#### References

General: Pru Sanderson Design Pty Ltd, Kew Urban Conservation Study, 1988, G Butler & Associates, Kew B-graded places study (draft), 2001. Specific:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1930.

- <sup>2</sup> MMBW Plan no. 66, Kew, scale 160':1", dated 1904. Charleville is graded A in the 1988 City of Kew Urban Conservation Study, v. 2, Citation 21.
- <sup>3</sup> City of Kew Rate Books description cited in G Butler & Associates, Kew B-graded places study (draft), 2001.
- <sup>4</sup> Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, 1934; City of Kew Rate books, 1957-8, # 4335, nav £380.
- <sup>5</sup> Pattern of occupation derived from listings in the Sands & McDougall Directory of Victoria, various years between 1950 and 1974.
- <sup>6</sup> Details sourced from the City of Kew Building Index, #8988, dated 23 February 1981 (swimming pool); the City of Boroondara Building Index, BS-1255 20047648/0, dated 8 September 2004 (decking), and # BS-1068/990340/0, dated 12 March 1999 (restumping).
- <sup>7</sup> MMBW Plan no. 66, Kew, scale 160':1", dated 1904.
- <sup>8</sup> See, esp., William Hardy Wilson, 'Building Purulia', in Domestic Architecture in Australia, whole issue of Art in Australia, edited by Ure Smith and Bertram Stevens with Wilson as associate, 1919. Despite his reputation as a Sydney figure, Hardy Wilson was living at 84 Peel Street Kew when this house was being designed, and he was something of a presence in the Kew area. See Sands and McDougall's Victorian Post Office Directory, Melbourne, 1928.
- <sup>9</sup> Including medium-sized houses such as that later occupied by Marilyn Monroe. Cf. David Gebhard, Robert Winter et al., *Guide to the Architecture of Los Angeles and Southern California*, Peregrine Smith, Salt Lake, 1978.